

**CITY OF PUNTA GORDA, FLORIDA
PUNTA GORDA ISLES CANAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES
APRIL 18, 2022, 1:30 P.M.**

MEMBERS PRESENT: Cort, Chair
D'Amico, Dye, Hannon, Knabe, Ludvig, Sullivan

OTHERS PRESENT: Kristin Simeone, Finance Director; Cathy Miller, Public Works Supervisor; Gary Disher, Mapping, Permitting and Compliance Manger

CALL TO ORDER

Mr. Cort called the meeting to order at 1:30 p.m., followed by the Pledge of Allegiance.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

None.

1) **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

1.a Approval of Minutes: Punta Gorda Isles Canal Advisory Committee Meeting of March 21, 2022.

Exhibits:

Cover Page

03-21-2022 Minutes

Mr. Hannon **MOVED** to approve the March 21, 2022, minutes, **SECONDED** by Mr. Dye.

MOTION UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED.

2) **REPORTS**

2.a Finance Report March 2022

Exhibits:

Cover Page

PGI YTD Expenditure Report 04-05-2022

PGI YTD Revenue Report 04-05-2022

Mr. Cort questioned whether the debt service transfers and ending reserves, denoted in the expenditure report, were available to fund seawall replacements. Ms. Kristin Simeone, Finance Director, replied debt service transfers could not be used for any projects other than the Federal Emergency Management Agency (FEMA) rip rap project but reserves could be used; however, a minimum of 16% reserves was recommended to be maintained.

2.b [Budget Utilization Report March 2022](#)

Exhibits:

[Cover Page](#)

[PGI Utilization APR](#)

Ms. Miller announced mangrove trimming was completed at the Punta Gorda Isles (PGI) Perimeter Canal, navigable bird section, Nature Park and Surf Bird, adding sonar reading would commence in May 2022 and inlet dredging would commence in June 2022.

Mr. Ludvig recalled reading the City received a grant to dredge the Boat Club basin and approach, inquiring as to information regarding same.

Ms. Miller replied the location was not part of the Canal Maintenance District (District), verifying the City was only responsible for dredging the navigable channel.

Ms. Simeone clarified the grant had been applied for and not received as of yet.

Mr. Dye questioned if the District was responsible for mangrove mitigation fees.

Ms. Miller responded affirmatively.

Mr. Gary Disher, Mapping, Permitting and Compliance Manager, added mitigation fees were typically included in project costs, noting an account would need to be established once mangrove mitigation became a normal mode of operation for the District.

A brief discussion ensued regarding the City's process for mitigating and trimming mangroves, with Mr. Disher verifying seawalls that were obstructed by mangroves could not be assessed.

2.c [Seawall Replacement Status Report March 2022](#)

Exhibits:

[Cover Page](#)

[PGI Status Report APR](#)

Ms. Miller indicated seawall replacements were moving forward, but the contractor was having difficulty obtaining concrete.

2.d [Permits Authorized by City Staff March 2022](#)

Exhibits:

[Cover Page](#)

[PGI Canal Maintenance Report Mar 2022](#)

Ms. Miller announced 18 permits were authorized by staff for the PGI District.

2.e [Punta Gorda Isles Capital Improvement Status Report March 2022](#)

Exhibits:

[Cover Page](#)

[PGI Capital Improvement Status 202204](#)

Mr. Disher announced the final Feasibility Study for the Spoil Site Channel project by Hans Wilson & Associates was almost complete, adding the Ponce de Leon Inlet Widening project was included in the report as a placeholder.

2.f [Master Permit Agreement Status Report March 2022](#)

Exhibits:

[Cover Page](#)

[MasterPermitStatus202203](#)

Mr. Disher reported the agencies and consultants were working on the required permitting, adding the Laishley Marina Submerged Lands Lease was presented to City Council and was moving forward.

Mr. Hannon inquired as to what the City used for rip rap.

Mr. Disher responded the City was not permitted to use rip rap at this time and would be able to do so once the required permitting was obtained.

2.g [Presentation & Discussion of FY 2022 Operating Budget/CIP FY2022-2027](#)

Exhibits:

[Cover Page](#)

[PGI Canal District Advisory Committee PowerPoint 4-18-2022](#)

[PGI Canal Maintenance Proforma FY 2023 Base](#)

[PGI Capital Outlay and Special Projects FY 2023-2027](#)

[PGI Line Item Expenditure Budget 04-14-2022](#)

Ms. Simeone reviewed the Fiscal Year (FY) 2023 Budget Workshop presentation for the PGI District, beginning with a brief history of assessments (slide 2). She next provided an in depth review of the proforma assumptions for base revenues and expenditures (slides 4-6) as well as summarized the 5-Year Special Project Program, pending items not included in the proforma assessment expenditures and the base proforma for FY 2022 – 2027 (slides 7-9). She then drew members' attention to the items listed under the PGI District Fund discussion (slides 10-11), which included the results from two years of seawall assessments and a request for an additional maintenance worker.

Mr. Dye questioned the cost to the City for replacement of seawalls per linear foot (lf).

Ms. Simeone responded a standard 10-foot seawall panel, including labor and materials, was approximately \$63.03, noting same was estimated to increase to \$66.18 in FY 2023.

Ms. Miller verified the overall cost was approximately \$380 per lf.

Mr. Cort recalled the Committee had suggested an increase in seawall production to avoid potential failures, noting the District could otherwise reach a point where they did not have the capacity to replace failing seawalls.

Ms. Miller added the decrease in available staging lots for the City could increase costs as well.

Mr. Cort recalled the recommendation from Taylor Engineering following the Seawall Materials and Feasibility Study (Study) was to double the rate of replacements, noting the Committee had recommended a \$150 increase; however, City Council had rejected same.

A question and answer session took place regarding the specifications of the information in the base proforma for FY 2022 through 2027.

Ms. Simeone indicated the two main concerns to address for the FY 2023 budget were whether members approved of an additional staff member and whether they recommended an increase to the seawall replacement program.

Mr. Cort opined an additional staff member was needed if production was struggling.

Mr. Knabe inquired as to the amount of seawalls that needed to be produced to align with needed replacements.

Ms. Miller responded 12,000 lf per year was recommended. She indicated staff was 5 weeks out for work orders, adding other work was suffering due to manufacturing of seawalls being a priority.

Mr. Dye questioned whether outsourcing production of seawalls was a more cost effective alternative.

Ms. Miller replied there were quality control issues when the City had outsourced production previously, adding transferring the seawall panels from another location would also increase construction costs.

Mr. Cort confirmed the Committee's consensus was to support an additional staff member. He then indicated the seawall replacement rate was next for consideration, recalling the Committee's recommendation to increase replacement rates slightly over 25% was denied.

Mr. Ludvig opined the recommendations from Taylor Engineering were unrealistic and unachievable from a performance perspective, suggesting the projects be addressed in a more manageable way each year while recognizing there were certain projects that needed to be completed by specific dates.

Mr. Dye indicated having the percentage of seawalls which needed to be replaced annually would be helpful.

Mr. Disher provided an explanation of the process used to identify which seawalls needed to be replaced, particularly ones that were rated 5 (worst condition).

A lengthy discussion ensued regarding increasing the rate of seawall replacements, with areas of concern including the conditions of the seawalls, increasing material and labor costs and how to educate residents on same.

Mr. Cort expressed concern regarding the pushback received from City Council after the Committee had recommended a \$150 increase; however, he suggested the recommendation remain the same with the knowledge rates would need to increase annually in order to reach an appropriate replacement rate.

Mr. Dye concurred, adding a homeowner would typically pay significantly more for private maintenance of their seawalls.

Mr. Cort confirmed there was Committee consensus to recommend a \$150 increase. He then indicated pushback might be received from residents at end of canal locations as assessment rates increased, questioning if the City should consider whether charging a flat rate per unit was ideal.

Mr. Disher responded the assessment methodology had already been litigated and discussed in previous years.

Mr. Cort concluded the Committee's recommendations would be presented at the May 12, 2022, workshop.

3) QUASI-JUDICIAL PUBLIC HEARINGS

STAFF COMMENTS

[Punta Gorda Isles Canal Advisory Committee Revised Meeting Dates for 2022-2023](#)

Exhibits:

[Cover Page](#)

[PGI CAC 2022 2023 REVISED Meeting Dates](#)

Ms. Miller announced meetings would be held at the Military Heritage Museum (Museum) during renovation of City Hall, verifying the July 18, 2022, meeting would need to be rescheduled as meetings could not be held at City Hall following July 14, 2022. She indicated there were dates earlier in the month that were available or the July 2022 meeting could be cancelled.

Mr. Ludvig **MOVED** to cancel the July 2022 meeting, **SECONDED** by Mr. Hannon.

MOTION UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED.

Recording Secretary Pues then stated the 2023 meeting dates were included in the agenda material for members to review and approve so that those dates could be submitted to the Museum.

Mr. Cort questioned the reason January 9, 2023, was proposed as meetings in January typically fell after the Martin Luther King Jr. Holiday.

Recording Secretary Pues responded she would verify same.

NOTE: The following discussion commenced after the PGI Canal Maintenance Assessment Fees discussion.

Recording Secretary Pues verified the date selected for January 2023 was an oversight and could be changed if members desired.

Mr. Cort suggested the date be changed to January 17, 2022, as January 9, 2022, fell too close to the December 2022 meeting date as well as to the holiday season.

Recording Secretary Pues confirmed there were no objections to same.

Mr. Dye **MOVED** to accept the 2023 dates, **SECONDED** by Mr. Knabe.

MOTION UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED.

Recording Secretary Pues concluded the only further changes that could be made to the meeting dates were cancellations

[Punta Gorda Isles Canal Maintenance Assessment Fees Public Meeting](#)

[Exhibits:](#)

[Cover Page](#)

Ms. Miller reiterated a budget workshop was scheduled for May 12, 2022, requesting members attend same to hear residents' input. She concluded with a summary of the methods she used to advertise the workshop, inquiring if members had additional recommendations.

Mr. Ludvig suggested contacting the Punta Gorda Boaters Alliance to advertise the workshop.

Ms. Miller then announced Mr. Rick Keeney, Public Works Director, would be retiring on April 30, 2022, after 42 years of service with the City.

MEMBER COMMENTS

None.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 3:03 p.m.

Chair

Recording Secretary