

**PUNTA GORDA ISLES
CANAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE
MEETING
OCTOBER 18, 2021**

MEMBERS PRESENT: Paul Raffa, Acting Chair
Jake Dye, Fred Hannon,
Robert Knabe, Ronald Ludvig,
Timothy Sullivan

MEMBERS ABSENT: Fredric Cort

OTHERS PRESENT: Rick Keeney, Public Works Director
Cathy Miller, Canal Maintenance Supervisor
Gary Disher, Mapping, Permitting and Compliance Manager
Bryan Clemons, Public Works Engineering Manager
Katie Evans, Annette Schreiber, James Loy, Robert Meraglio,
Vicky Arnold, Andrew Templeman, Taylor McCarty, James McCarty,
Debra McCarty, Cheryl Foley, David Hoffman

CALL TO ORDER/ANNOUNCEMENTS

- Mr. Raffa called the meeting to order at 1:30 p.m., followed by the Pledge of Allegiance.
- A. Roll Call
- Recording Secretary Pues swore in all participants of the quasi-judicial public hearings.
- B. Next Scheduled Meeting
- 1. November 15, 2021

CITIZEN COMMENTS ON AGENDA ITEMS ONLY

- None.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

- A. September 20, 2021
- Mr. Knabe MOVED, Mr. Dye SECONDED approval of the September 20, 2021, minutes.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

REPORTS

- A. Finance Reports – September 2021
- Ms. Cathy Miller, Canal Maintenance Supervisor, confirmed there were no questions regarding the financial reports denoted in the agenda material. She then welcomed Mr. Sullivan as a new member to the Committee.
- B. Budget Utilization Report – September 2021 End of Year and October 2021 New Budget
- Ms. Miller indicated the budget utilization reports included the ending numbers for Fiscal Year (FY) 2020/2021 and the beginning numbers for FY 2021/2022.

- C. Seawall Replacement Status Reports – September 2021 End of Year and October 2021 New Budget
- Ms. Miller stated the seawall replacement report for FY 2020/2021 was included in the agenda material, noting construction at Via Venice was not complete until the sod was installed. She pointed out the seawall replacement schedule for FY 2021/2022 was also included in the agenda material, concluding the schedule was subject to change.
- D. Permits Authorized by the City – September 2021
- Ms. Miller announced there were 27 active permits as of October 2021 for the Punta Gorda Isles (PGI) Canal Maintenance Assessment District.
- E. PGI Capital Improvement Status – September 2021
- Mr. Gary Disher, Mapping, Permitting and Compliance Manager, reported a purchase order (PO) was issued to Hans Wilson and Associates for the feasibility study of the Spoil Site Channel project. He indicated the Ponce De Leon Inlet Widening project was still on hold.
- F. Master Permit Agreement Status – September 2021
- Mr. Disher stated the corrected Florida Department of Environmental Protection permit was received for the seawall/rip-rap permit, adding staff was still working with the consultants on a response to the Army Corps of Engineers. He indicated a PO was issued to the consultant for the dredging permit, noting the additional permits were related to the Laishley Marina.
 - Mr. Dye inquired as to how often the submerged land lease for Laishley Marina needed to be renewed.
 - Mr. Disher replied with uncertainty, noting the Finance Department tasked him with same.

QUASI-JUDICIAL PUBLIC HEARINGS

- A. Special Permit – CCSP-07-2021 – Petition for Special Permit under the provisions of Chapter 6, Section 2-1(e) of the Punta Gorda Code to install a boat lift with two (2) boat lift pilings, a portion of the boat lift and a portion of a two (2) foot wide aluminum walkway outside the structure limitation lines, which is prohibited by Section 2-1(c)(5), Punta Gorda Code, at Lot 22, Block 36, Section 5, aka 1719 Belle Court, Punta Gorda, Florida 33950
- Owner/Petitioner: Mark Stevenson
Charlotte County Parcel: 412211435002
- Mr. Bryan Clemons, Public Works Engineering Manager, displayed photographs and proposed construction drawings from the agenda material, briefly reviewing the request. He stated the property had 50 linear feet (lf) of seawall and the canal was approximately

122 If wide, concluding staff recommended denial of the request as per Chapter 6, Section 2-1(e)(4) of the Punta Gorda Code.

- Mr. Dye questioned the rationale for constructing the boat lift outside of the structure limitation line.
 - Ms. Katie Evans, authorized agent, responded same was necessary due to the size of the applicant's vessel. She explained the reasoning for the proposed configurations of the request, including future considerations for the residents at the end of the canal.
 - Discussion ensued regarding the details of the request along with alternatives to same, with Mr. Clemons verifying staff recommended denial of the request due to navigational concerns.
 - Ms. Annette Schreiber indicated a boat lift might be installed where her existing one was, noting the request would prevent safe navigation to same.
 - Mr. James Loy spoke in opposition to the request.
 - Mr. Clemons pointed out the current design had the front of the boat lift 3 feet from the seawall and dredging limitations were 7 feet from the seawall, indicating there would be potential issues with same.
 - Ms. Evans requested a two-month continuance to revise the request.
 - Mr. Ludvig MOVED, Mr. Dye SECONDED to continue the request to December 20, 2021, meeting.
 - Mr. Loy spoke against a continuance.
 - Mr. Raffa called three times for public comment.
 - Mr. Dye MOVED, Mr. Ludvig SECONDED to close the public hearing. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.
 - Mr. Dye spoke in favor of a continuance to reconfigure the boat lift so that same fit within the structure limitation lines, pointing out a vote was needed for the continuance.
 - MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.
- B. Special Permit – CCSP-15-2021 – Petition for Special Permit under the provisions of Chapter 6, Section 2-1(e) of the Punta Gorda Code to install a boat lift with three (3) boat lift pilings, a portion of the boat lift and a portion of a two (2) foot wide aluminum walkway outside the structure limitation lines, which is prohibited by Section 2-1(c)(5), Punta Gorda Code, at Lot 1, Block 29, Section 5, aka 221 Belvedere Court, Punta Gorda, Florida 33950
- Owner/Petitioner: Robert Meraglio
Charlotte County Parcel: 412214207001
- Mr. Clemons indicated the request was continued from the August 27, 2021, meeting. He then displayed photographs and proposed construction drawings from the agenda

material, briefly reviewing the request. He stated the property had 39.6 lf of seawall and the canal was approximately 198 lf wide, noting staff recommended approval of the request based on review of the application as per Chapter 6, Section 2-1(e)(4), Punta Gorda Code. He explained another continuance could be granted since Mr. Mike Parr, applicant's representative, was unable to attend the meeting this date due to an illness, verifying modifications had not been made to the original request; however, Mr. Parr would need to answer any questions regarding same.

- Mr. Robert Meraglio, applicant, stated the property owner of Lot 2 indicated she had to reconstruct her boat lift due to the request; however, she then implied she was on board with same. He opined the proposed configurations of his boat lift as well as for the boat lift at Lot 2 made sense for the location, concluding the request would not impact navigation for any of the other neighboring property owners.
- Ms. Vicky Arnold, Lot 2, expressed dissatisfaction with spending the funds for another boat lift since the existing one was satisfactory; however, she stated she was willing to accept the request as she would also be applying for a boat lift, anticipating Mr. Meraglio would not oppose same.
- Mr. Meraglio reiterated the configurations of the boat lifts were needed for the location, concluding he would not object to the proposed boat lift when installed.
- Mr. Dye recalled discussion regarding end of canal locations, noting the existing boat lift at Lot 2 was likely built without a special permit as same was within the structure limitation lines.
- Mr. Raffa called three times for public comment.
- Mr. Dye MOVED, Mr. Ludvig SECONDED to close the public hearing. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.
- Mr. Dye pointed out a continuance was not requested, noting members would need to decide whether approve or deny the request this date.
- Mr. Dye MOVED, Mr. Hannon SECONDED to approve Special Permit CCSP-15-2021. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

C. Special Permit – CCSP-16-2021 – Petition for Special Permit under the provisions of Chapter 6, Section 2-1(e) of the Punta Gorda Code to install a boat lift with three (3) boat lift pilings, a portion of the boat lift and a portion of a two (2) foot wide aluminum walkway outside the structure limitation lines, which is prohibited by Section 2-1(c)(5), Punta Gorda Code, at Lot 18, Block 105, Section 11, aka 1242 Spanish Cay Lane, Punta Gorda, Florida 33950

Owner/Petitioner: Mobley Properties LLC – James Mobley

Charlotte County Parcel: 412212483007

- Mr. Clemons indicated the request was continued from the August 27, 2021, meeting. He then displayed photographs and proposed construction drawings from the agenda material, briefly reviewing the revised request. He stated the property had 40 lf of seawall and the canal was approximately 205 lf wide, noting the revised plans reduced the dock width to 23 feet and there was a slight shift to the walkway. He verified staff recommended approval of the request based on review of the application as per Chapter 6, Section 2-1(e)(4), Punta Gorda Code, reiterating Mr. Mike Parr, applicant's representative, was unable to attend the meeting this date to answer any questions.
 - Mr. Andrew Templeman stated he was giving verbal notice to the Committee that he would be filing a form with the Florida Board of Professional Registration, speaking against the City's process for approving special permits.
 - Mr. Raffa called three times for public comment.
 - Mr. Dye MOVED, Mr. Knabe SECONDED to close the public hearing. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.
 - Mr. Dye inquired whether members desired additional information from Mr. Parr regarding the request.
 - Mr. Raffa indicated members could move forward with a continuance since the construction's design had changed.
 - Mr. Dye MOVED to continue Special Permit CCSP-16-2021 to the December 20, 2021, meeting.
 - Mr. Clemons noted the request could be continued to the November 15, 2021, meeting.
 - Mr. Dye MOVED, Mr. Ludvig SECONDED to amend the motion and continue Special Permit CCSP-16-2021 to the November 15, 2021, meeting. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.
- D. Special Permit – CCSP-19-2021 – Petition for Special Permit under the provisions of Chapter 6, Section 2-1(e) of the Punta Gorda Code to install a boat lift with three (3) boat lift pilings, a portion of the boat lift and a portion of a two (2) foot wide aluminum walkway outside the structure limitation lines, which is prohibited by Section 2- 1(c)(5), Punta Gorda Code, at Lot 26, Block 208, Section 14, aka 1221 Spoonbill Drive, Punta Gorda, Florida 33950
- Owner/Petitioner: Patrick and Lisa Galli
Charlotte County Parcel: 412224433002
- Mr. Clemons indicated the request was continued from the September 20, 2021, meeting. He then displayed photographs and proposed construction drawings from the agenda material, briefly reviewing the request. He stated the property had 40 lf of seawall and the canal was approximately 137 lf wide, noting the revised plans reduced

- the dock width to 24 feet. He concluded staff recommended approval of the request based on review of the application as per Chapter 6, Section 2-1(e)(4), Punta Gorda Code.
- Mr. Taylor McCarty, 1217 Spoonbill, stated the request did not consider the existing boat lift at his property which was recently approved by the City, displaying an overhead view of same. He commented his boat lift was installed within the boat limitation lines and was for a smaller vessel, speaking in opposition to the request as same would impede access to his boat lift.
 - Mr. Dye recalled the boat orientation would be in the other direction when the request was presented at the previous meeting, adding same gave the impression the intent was to enter the boat lift from the left side to the right.
 - Mr. James McCarty indicated members were not listening to neighboring property owners who were present and opposed the request, emphasizing the configuration of the proposed boat lift should remain within the guidelines of the Code.
 - Mr. Dye expressed desire for Mr. Mike Parr, applicant's representative, to appear before the Committee and address the details of the request, reiterating the information presented at the previous meeting appeared inaccurate.
 - Ms. Debra McCarty noted she was in contact with Mayor Lynne Matthews regarding the request, opining the applicant should install a dock to store a smaller vessel and follow the rules.
 - Ms. Cheryl Foley, Lot 23, indicated the request did not allow equal access to boat lifts within the subject location, speaking in opposition to the request due to navigational issues; additionally, she objected to contractors speaking on behalf of applicants as same did not appear fair.
 - Mr. Dye questioned the reason staff recommended approval of the request.
 - Mr. Clemons responded he thought the intent was for the vessel to enter the boat lift from the other direction, noting same could potentially cause changes.
 - Ms. Foley indicated the alternative direction would still cause issues, adding the applicant was not present to explain the reason for the request.
 - Mr. Dye opined a representative or the applicant should be present to explain the request in order for same to move forward.
 - Mr. Raffa called three times for public comment.
 - Mr. Dye MOVED, Mr. Knabe SECONDED to close the public hearing. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.
 - Mr. Disher explained the request could be continued since the representative was unable to attend the meeting this date due to an illness.

- Mr. Dye MOVED, Mr. Knabe SECONDED to continue Special Permit CCSP-19-2021 to the November 15, 2021, meeting. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

NOTE: Mr. Dye stepped down from the dais at 2:57 p.m.

- E. Special Permit – CCSP-21-2021 – Petition for Special Permit under the provisions of Chapter 6, Section 2-1(e) of the Punta Gorda Code to install a third boat lift (personal watercraft lift), which is prohibited by Section 2-1(c)(2), Punta Gorda Code, at Lot 05, Block 29, Section 05, aka 285 Belvedere Court, Punta Gorda, Florida 33950
Owner/Petitioner: Florent Baillot
Charlotte County Parcel: 412214206004
- Mr. Clemons displayed photographs and proposed construction drawings from the agenda material, briefly reviewing the request. He stated the personal watercraft lift (PWL) held a single watercraft rather than two, concluding staff recommended approval of the request based on review of the application as per Chapter 6, Section 2-1(e)(4) of the Punta Gorda Code.
- Mr. Jake Dye, applicant’s representative, disclosed he was a member of the Committee (Form 8B Conflict of Interest attached), then provided an explanation of the specifications for the proposed boat lift.
- Mr. David Hoffman opined approval of a third boat lift would set a precedent; additionally, he expressed concern regarding clutter, requesting members consider denying the request.
- Mr. Dye acknowledged concerns regarding clutter; however, the proposed boat lift would store the personal watercraft on the dock and should not be visible while on the dock.
- Mr. Ludvig verified the existing dock would be replaced with a larger dock and received clarification of the specifications of the request.
- Mr. Raffa called three times for public comment.
- Mr. Ludvig MOVED, Mr. Knabe SECONDED to close the public hearing. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.
- Mr. Ludvig noted the requirements for two boat lifts predated PWLs, speaking in favor of the request.
- Mr. Knabe MOVED, Mr. Hannon SECONDED to approve Special Permit CCSP-21-2021. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

NOTE: Mr. Dye returned to the dais at 3:07 p.m.

STAFF COMMENTS

- None.

COMMITTEE/BOARD COMMENTS

- Mr. Dye stated certain boat lifts and docks that met the Code and were approved through the Building Division did not work on properties with smaller seawalls, opining same should have been examined in previous years as now structures built within the requirements were conflicting with requests for special permits.
- Discussion ensued regarding the issues which occur at end of canal locations, including existing structures installed under the current Code and future requests that could impede same.
- Mr. Hannon then commented he was unaware of members discussing any business outside of a meeting.
- Mr. Disher explained members were allowed to speak to residents or staff regarding business that might come before the Committee.

ADJOURNMENT

- Meeting Adjourned: 3:20 p.m.

Paul Raffa, Acting Chair

Leah Pues, Recording Secretary