

**BURNT STORE ISLES
CANAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE
MEETING
OCTOBER 13, 2020**

MEMBERS PRESENT: Mike McIntosh, Chairman
Rick Daugherty, Sean Harrigan,
Charles Longenbarger

MEMBERS ABSENT: Norman Ashworth

OTHERS PRESENT: Rick Keeney, Public Works Director
Cathy Miller, Canal Maintenance Supervisor
Gary Disher, Mapping, Permitting and Compliance Manager
Bob Nikula, Public Works Project Manager
Mike Parr, Bob Fritz

CALL TO ORDER/ANNOUNCEMENTS

- Mr. McIntosh called the meeting to order at 1:30 p.m.
- A. Roll Call
- B. Next Scheduled Meeting
- 1. November 10, 2020

CITIZEN COMMENTS ON AGENDA ITEMS ONLY

- None.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

- A. September 8, 2020
- Mr. Harrigan MOVED, Mr. Daugherty SECONDED approval of the September 8, 2020, minutes. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

REPORTS

- A. Finance Reports - September 2020
 - Ms. Cathy Miller, Canal Maintenance Supervisor, explained the Finance Department was currently working on closing the 2020 Fiscal Year (FY) and the September 2020 report would be available at the November 10, 2020, meeting.
- B. Budget Utilization Report - September 2020
 - Ms. Miller stated the September 2020 report reflected the final amount spent during the previous fiscal year.
- C. Seawall Replacement Status Reports - September 2020
 - Ms. Miller drew attention to the Burnt Store Isles (BSI) Seawall Replacement Program for FY 2020/2021, noting same was subject to change. She concluded notices were sent to property owners so they could begin to prepare their properties.
- D. Permits Authorized by City Staff - September 2020

- Ms. Miller confirmed there were 8 permits authorized in September 2020.
- E. BSI Capital Improvement Status Report - Update
- Mr. Gary Disher, Mapping, Permitting and Compliance Manager, noted the Seawall Materials & Methods Feasibility Study (Feasibility Study) by Taylor Engineering (TE) would be discussed under Unfinished Business. He then stated the Army Corp of Engineers issued public notice for the BSI Inlet Widening project, concluding there was no further information relating to same at this time.

PUBLIC HEARING

- Recording Secretary Pues swore in all participants.
- A. Special Permit – CCSP-22-2020 - Petition for Special Permit under the provisions of Section 6-6(j) of the Punta Gorda Code to install a boat lift with three (3) boat lift pilings and a portion of a two (2) foot wide aluminum walkway outside the 45 degree angle which is prohibited by Section 6-6(c)4, Punta Gorda Code, at Lot 16, Block 263, Section 15, aka 518 St. Girons Court, Punta Gorda, Florida 33950
Owner/Petitioner: Merritt Brown
Charlotte County Parcel: 412319479003
- Mr. Bob Nikula, Public Works Project Manager, displayed photographs of the subject property and proposed construction drawings from the agenda material, providing a brief review of the request. He stated the furthest piling extended 24 feet waterward from the seawall, concluding staff recommended approval of the request.
- A brief discussion ensued regarding the details of the request, with members confirming same would no longer require the applicant to reverse their vessel into the dock and would configure the vessel to be stored as close to the subject properties' seawall as could be accommodated.
- Mr. McIntosh called three times for public comment.
- Mr. Harrigan MOVED, Mr. Longenbarger SECONDED to close the public hearing. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.
- Mr. Harrigan MOVED, Mr. Daugherty SECONDED to approve CCSP-22-2020. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

NEW BUSINESS

- No Items.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

- A. Seawall Materials & Methods Feasibility Study – Staff Recommendation
- Ms. Miller provided a detailed history on the progression of the Canal Maintenance District (District), including the seawall materials utilized along with the previous and current seawall replacement and inspection processes. She then drew attention to four

components identified in the Feasibility Study: (1) Structural design modifications (2) Seawall production and replacement rates (3) Standardized seawall inspection process (4) Considerations of future construction staging and barge transport access. She explained staff desired a recommendation from members for each component, noting the information would be included when the Feasibility Study was presented to City Council. She clarified changes could still be implemented during the budgeting process each year, then reviewed TE's recommendations in comparison to staffs, as denoted in the agenda material.

- Mr. Harrigan MOVED, Mr. Daugherty SECONDED to approve the Structural Design Modification component as presented. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.
- Ms. Miller presented two options to consider for the seawall production and replacement rates: Option 1 - annual rate increase of \$100 per Equivalent Residential Unit (ERU) which would provide an additional 324 linear feet (LF) of seawall replacement for an estimated total of 1,311 LF of seawall replaced each year; Option 2 - annual rate increase of \$150 per ERU which would provide an additional 486 LF of annual seawall replacement for an estimated total of 1,473 LF of seawall replaced each year. She noted 18% of BSI's seawall system had currently been replaced.
- Mr. Harrigan verified whichever option members recommended could be modified annually as needed. He noted additional proposed projects for BSI would also cause rate increases, opining same should be staged incrementally as to prevent rates from doubling within the next couple of years.
- Ms. Miller explained the rate increase would include the ability to hire additional staff and increase the cast yard for seawalls, noting staff felt a \$100 or \$150 increase would be more acceptable to the District.
- Mr. Daugherty spoke in favor of staff's recommendation as long as same could be reevaluated and adjusted as needed.
- Mr. McIntosh questioned whether the annual rate of \$460 still included the \$90 charge for dredging the BSI Rim Canal.
- Ms. Miller replied in the negative, verifying that loan had been paid.
- Mr. Longenbarger opined residents would not be satisfied with the proposed rate increases, speaking in opposition of raising same by \$150.
- Mr. Rick Keeney, Public Works Director, explained the recommendations were to assist staff with direction for the following year's budget, verifying rate increases would not go into effect until FY 2021/2022.

- Mr. McIntosh spoke in favor of the \$100 increase, opining residents might be amenable to same since the rate would be similar to the previous \$90 charge for dredging the BSI Rim Canal.
- Mr. Harrigan indicated there was a responsibility to educate the community on the reasoning for the rate increases and the considerations that went into same.
- Mr. Disher displayed the 2019-20 Seawall Assessment Monitor Wall Summary, noting same contained the conditions of the seawall with 5 being the worst condition and 1 being the best condition. He stated there was currently more than 17,000 feet of original seawall with some form of damage, noting same would take approximately 17 years to replace if the program were to remain the same.
- Mr. Longenbarger indicated costs for the BSI Inlet Widening project and BSI Channel Corner Widening project should be considered before increasing the assessment rates.
- Mr. Disher stated costs depended on the type of financing members chose, adding construction for the projects was estimated to begin in FY 2023/2024.
- Mr. Daugherty MOVED, Mr. Harrigan SECONDED to reject the recommendation to replace 12,500 LF of seawall for the first 10 years and increase replacement to 22,500 LF of seawall beginning 2030. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.
- Mr. Daugherty MOVED, Mr. Harrigan SECONDED to approve the proposed \$100 assessment rate increase for the Seawall Production and Replacement Rates contingent upon same being assessed annually and adjusted as needed.
- VOTING AYE: Daugherty, Harrigan, McIntosh.
- VOTING NAY: Longenbarger.
- MOTION CARRIED.
- Mr. Daugherty MOVED, Mr. Longenbarger SECONDED to reject the proposed \$150 assessment rate increase for the Seawall Production and Replacement Rates. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.
- Ms. Miller stated staff recommended the Standardized Seawall Inspection process be completed every two years, with the northerly half of Punta Gorda Isles (PGI) being inspected one year and the southerly half along with BSI the alternating year.
- Mr. Harrigan MOVED, Mr. Daugherty SECONDED to approve staff's recommendation to complete the Standardized Seawall Inspections process every two years. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.
- Ms. Miller then stated the City had already purchased the recommended American Society of Civil Engineers Waterfront Facilities Inspection and Assessment manual, noting minor revisions were being made to the data collection software and inspection forms based on same.

- Mr. Disher reviewed the considerations of future construction staging and barge transport access, noting a study completed at the end of September 2020 found 58 available lots (11% availability) in the northern side of the canal system and 65 available lots (12.8% availability) in the southern side. He stated staff determined the current number of staging locations was adequate for a few more years dependent on growth, adding staff would continue to monitor availability as time progressed. He concluded a budget increase for travel distance was not needed at this time.
- Mr. Daugherty inquired as to Colony Point as an eventual staging location.
- Discussion ensued regarding possible staging locations along with the additional proposed projects which would widen the canals to allow fully loaded barges to navigate through the subdivision, with Mr. Disher verifying the feasibility of utilizing a local commercial facility could be explored.
- Mr. Harrigan MOVED, Mr. Daugherty SECONDED to approve staff's recommendations for construction staging and barge transport access. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.
- Mr. Disher concluded member's feedback would move forward to Council.

STAFF COMMENTS

- Mr. Disher announced Council approved the revisions to Chapter 6 at their October 7, 2020, meeting. He then stated he would meet with Hans Wilson and Associates regarding re-permitting for seawall replacement and rip-rap, noting meetings were scheduled with the Department of Environmental Protection (DEP) on October 12, 2020, and the Army Corps of Engineers on October 20, 2020. He explained anything along the perimeter canal had a different permitting basis which might require additional attention; however, the vast majority of the canal system should be simple to permit. He stated further considerations relating to the proposed Rip-Rap Mitigation project (Project) could be discussed once permitting was obtained, adding the impact of the Project would be great (10 miles of rip-rap) and staff was uncertain how agencies would respond to same.
- Mr. Harrigan questioned how to justify the costs to residents.
- Mr. Disher pointed out the grant from the Federal Emergency Management Agency (FEMA) was only to add rip-rap in front of the damaged element seawalls, noting rip-rap could only be installed in front of seawalls which were just replaced to apply for the mitigation funds. He then stated a site visit was scheduled with Hans Wilson and Associates on October 16, 2020, to evaluate the conditions of the PGI and BSI canal systems to develop the permitting language.

COMMITTEE/BOARD COMMENTS

- Mr. McIntosh noted the City's Police Department was currently updating a trifold relating to the City's public waterways and what was permitted within same.
- Ms. Miller verified the revised document should be available by the November 10, 2020, meeting.

CITIZENS' COMMENTS

- Mr. Bob Fritz recommended members meet with Mr. Bill Courtney from the BSI Civic Association to promote the need for rate increases. He then suggested members consider the annual rate for seawall production and replacement be reduced to \$50 and utilize the other \$50 toward the BSI Inlet Widening project, opining residents would be more receptive to smaller rate increases.

ADJOURNMENT

- Meeting Adjourned: 2:50 p.m.

Mike McIntosh, Chairman

Leah Pues, Recording Secretary